**Detailed Methodology for Urban Governance Case Study (Draft For Discussion)**

The focus of the Urban Governance case study is on the shifts and changes governance eco system and urban local body of the city before and after JNNURM. While, urban local body is the the central object of attention for this case study, other actors and their inter-relationships will also be an area of study for this case study.

The governance eco-system is defined for purpose of this study as comprising of units in government , also outside ;comprising range of formal and informal arrangements, codes – laws, regulations, orders, as well as understandings,Purpose – provision of public goods/regulation of actions pertaining to the same interfacing to produce certain outcomes. Assumption that there is a certain pattern and certain character to these dynamic interfaces. Also that this ecosystem has a certain specificity in particular places. The governance ecosystem is highly linked to the political economy of a particular place – it has specific dimensions but is important to look at the part- whole relationships, also there is a materiality to them, distinction between expressions, more deep patterns.

The research questions addressed by the urban governance case study are

1. How has ULB and urban governance system been affected by the experience of implementing JNNURM projects and reforms ?
2. What are the intra and supra sectoral changes in the urban local body/ governance eco system caused by JNNURM and its reform agenda?
3. How has the local and regional political economy impacted the passage of JNNURM and what does that experience reveal about the policy design?

**Steps for the case study**

**1. Preparing a Analytical City Profile (Backdrop/Background)**

The city profile will provide and context for understanding the city and changes to its governance eco system as a result of JNNURM. The city profile will be brief, analytical and relevant for understanding changes and shifts in urban governance in the city.

a) History and Geography of the City

The historical role of the city and its geographical features will enable the understanding the current context of the urban governance and development . For example, how did the city develop, what roles or functions did it play, how has it changed post-independence or post-formation of the state.What are the geographical features of the city in terms of terrain, natural resources, whether coastal or situated on a river. The sources of data will include secondary literature on the city and existing (or where appropriate, newly created) maps of the city and its region.

*Method:* For this section, review of literature (including policy documents) will be the main method.

b) The Social, Economic and Environmental Profile of City

This section will provide an overview of the social composition, demographics, economic activities, environmental factors of the city. The section will enable an understanding of the society, economy and physical environment of the city to understand the main actors in governance, the sectors that are important to city, social groups and classes that are dominant and marginalised within the city and politics of the city. While, review of literature will be the main method, relevant information from interviews and focus group discussions can also be incorporated for this section.

This section will include a spatial analysis of the city, meaning a description of which are the core areas of the city, in which direction is the city growing, what are the main road networks and connections in the city, what are the areas in which specific kinds of activities take place (commercial, residential, institutional , industrial, public etc). This may or may not include an analysis of development plans for the city (wherever such plans exist).

**2. Before and After JNNURM: Shifts in Governance Trajectory in City**

Through this section, we try to understand the governance ecosystem of the city, the web of relationships between institutions and role and place of urban local body in this web and how JNNURM has transformed these institutions and their relationships.

- Has the urban local body gained power or has it been weakened by JNNURM?

- How has JNNURM strengthened or weakened the urban local body in three aspects- efficiency, inclusiveness and economic

- How much has JNNURM contributed in improving capacities and efficiencies of the urban local body in terms of delivery of services?

a) Major Economic, Social and Political actors and dynamics of the city

- The case study aims to understand the dynamics between various economic, social and political actors in the city (including relevant ones active at other scales: neighbourhood, district, state, centre etc) and how their roles are transformed through these dynamics.

- Understanding hierarchies, power relations and politics between actors and institutions is critical for understanding governance and infrastructure transformations.

- It would be interesting to note particular alliances across different levels and cutting across both political and market based actors, formed during particular points that were definitive in the city's development history – focus on how particular projects were built and by whose influence, examine periods of public investment in urban infrastructure or periods of major building actvity to systematically understand the role played by these alliances.

- While, review of literature may provide preliminary information, substantive information on this section will be gained through interviews and focus group discussions with officials, activists and citizens.

b) Mapping Institutions and their relationships

- This section examines the agencies and institutions active both formally and informally in urban governance. While institutions such as urban local bodies (ULBs), development authorities and sectoral parastatals that are formally active in governance.

- Other institutions such as religious institutions, ethnic associations, trade unions, committees, business and trade associations and so on who are informally active in governance of the city. This section also highlights the role of agencies and institutions in urban governance of the city and their inter-relationships with urban local body. While preliminary information for this section can be based on review of relevant documents, more critical and substantial information can be collected only through fieldwork. This requires a visual mapping of institutional actors followed by identification of key persons in such organizations who will then be interviewed.

- Snowball sampling will help in identifying and gaining access from one actor to the other.

- It should also include a history of the ULB – when was it formed, what has been its operating budget, what is the composition (past and current) of elected versus appointed members, what are the different administrative departments and have they undergone any streamlining or change since JNNURM? What have been the priority areas for the ULB – roads, sanitation, water supply etc and how have decisions been usually taken for the selection of what sector to prioritize? What have been the constraints and challenges (finances, no response from state government, no autonomy, no land, public resistance, lack of trained personnel, political interference) as well as spaces of opportunities to implement these ideas on the ground?

c) JNNURM projects and reforms

- The overview of the JNNURM projects that have been formulated, sanctioned and are being implemented in the city. This section will understand how projects were being formulated, how they were sanctioned and how implementation has happened on the ground.

- In case of JNNURM reforms, how the state and ULBs and governance eco system understands the reforms and how they are being implemented . Apart from secondary documents, accessing and reviewing of government documents and internal documents of ULBs (government resolutions, meeting minutes of standing committee deliberations) and other institutions and information from interviews will be required for this section.

Steps for this section

* Collect and analyse City Development Plan
* Collect and analyse complete data on projects being sanctioned and implemented in the city including Detailed Project Reports (DPRs). We may need to develop a common methodology for analyzing CDP and DPRs across cities.
* Understand which proposed projects were not sanctioned and why [are there other such less obvious research sub objectives we can list here? For instance, examining and understanding the debates at the city level whether in the standing committee or in the press, related to the projects. This particularly, is never done adequately.
* Understand how projects are progressing on the ground and what have been some of the issues facing each of the projects
* Understand Role of ULB and parastatals in projects

Method: If possible, access documentation produced by Consultants who have worked on preparing the CDP and also interview the consultants.

d) Reforms at state and ULB level

- How is the state government's position on various JNNURM reforms?

- How aligned is the ULB to this position or what is the extent of divergence of views,?

- What are the resistances to reform?

- What are the drivers for reforms?

- At ground level, how is it being implemented ? Is there any noticeable difference in the way JNNURM projects get implemented as opposed to other projects in the past?

-What are the impacts that are being felt by ULB and citizens ?

Method: interviews with ULB officials, officials at the state level, consultants, citizens, etc

e) Multiple Sectors

In urban governance case study, sectors are viewed as the space in which governance culture and institutional relationships play out. Water supply is the common sector across all case studies. The criteria for selection of other sectors needs to be clearly stated.

e1. Sectoral Profile

e2. Politics and Governance history of the sector

Which institutions play what kind of role in the governance of the sector and how is coordination achieved? This would involve mapping the role of each instituion involved in the governance of a particular sector. It would have to be supplemented with interviews with key persons or officials within the parastatals and other institutions involved in the sector.

e3. Service delivery history of sector- in terms of access, schemes, projects and programmes, financing, coverage

e4. Inter sectoral relationships in administration, delivery and user experience.

e5. Sectoral and Supra Sectoral Reforms at State and ULB level and their impacts

* Reforms that ULBs considers important
* Reforms creates new efficiencies and challenges for ULB
* Reforms viewed independently in terms of actual ground realities of sectors
* Influence of reform process on the sectors

How and what basis will the sectors be chosen for deeper engagement, especially if in these cities the JNNURM package involves more than 2/3 sectors? Water Supply is the common sector for all urban governance case studies.

What have been the official and informal changes in the eco system as a result of JNNURM, if changes have not happened, what are the factors for this, where are resistances coming from.

**3. Analysis and Conclusions**

a. Use JNNURM objectives and model - financial sustainability, decentralisation leading to strengthening of urban local bodies and inclusive cities as one of the analytical lenses to assess shifts in the city's governance eco system.

b. Developing a critique of the JNNURM model based on experiences of the city.

c. What are policy alternatives for next phase of JNNURM that emerges from the experience of the city.